

JAMES J DONELON, COMMISSIONER OF INSURANCE FOR THE STATE OF LOUISIANA VS TERRY S SHILLING, ET AL

No. C-651069

TO: J. E. CULLENS JR. WALTERS, PAPILLION, THOMAS, CULLENS, LLC 12345 PERKINS ROAD, BUILDING ONE BATON ROUGE, LA 70810

JUDGE HON. TIMOTHY E KELLEY DIVISION: 22

**REPORTER(S): KRIS FERACHI** 

NOTICE is hereby given that on 3/10/2021, upon motion of BUCK GLOBAL, LLC in the above numbered and entitled cause, an order of appeal was entered granting a DEVOLUTIVE appeal from the judgment of 2/25/21, which appeal is returnable to the FIRST CIRCUIT COURT OF APPEALS, in accordance with the law.

Baton Rouge, Louisiana, on the 10TH DAY OF MARCH, 2021.

**Deputy Clerk of Court for Doug Welborn, Clerk of Court** 

Trial date: 2/12/2021

**Estimated Hours of Testimony Taken: 1HR 25 MIN** 

**Estimated Costs of Testimony:** 

THIS IS NOT A BILL - JUST AN ESTIMATE

cc:

Civil Accounting (Clerk of Court)
Civil Appeal (Clerk of Court)
Reporter(s)
Judicial Administrator
All Counsel of Record
Divisional Office

EAST BATON ROUGE PARISH
Filed Mar 08, 2021 2:19 PM
Deputy Clerk of Court
E-File Received Mar 08, 2021 1:21 PM

# 19TH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT FOR THE PARISH OF EAST BATON ROUGE STATE OF LOUISIANA

NO.: 651,069 SECTION 22

JAMES J. DONELON, COMMISSIONER OF INSURANCE FOR THE STATE OF LOUISIANA, IN HIS CAPACITY AS REHABILITATOR OF LOUISIANA HEALTH COOPERATIVE, INC.

#### **VERSUS**

TERRY S. SHILLING, GEORGE G. CROMER, WARNER L. THOMAS, IV, WILLIAM A. OLIVER, CHARLES D. CALVI, PATRICK C. POWERS, CGI TECHNOLOGIES AND SOLUTIONS, INC., GROUP RESOURCES INCORPORATED, BEAM PARTNERS, LLC, MILLIMAN, INC., BUCK CONSULTANTS, LLC, AND TRAVELERS CASUALTY AND SURETY COMPANY OF AMERICA

WHEN THE I		
FILED:		٠
	DEPUTY CLERK	

# MOTION FOR DEVOLUTIVE APPEAL

NOW INTO COURT, through undersigned counsel, comes Buck Global, LLC f/k/a Buck Consultants, LLC ("Buck Global"), and, pursuant to La. Code of Civ. Proc. Articles 2121 and 2083, moves the Court for entry of an Order granting it an appeal from the Judgment signed by this Court on February 25, 2021, upon representing as follows:

1.

This Court signed and entered a Judgment on February 25, 2021 denying Buck Global's Motions to Compel the Louisiana Department of Insurance ("LDI") and Lewis & Ellis, Inc. ("L&E") to Comply with Subpoenas Duces Tecum. The Court's Judgment in favor of LDI and L&E wholly disposed of the issues between the non-parties, LDI and L&E, and the party filing the motions, Buck Global. The Court's Judgment was mailed to counsel on March 1, 2021.

2.

As the Louisiana First Circuit and other Louisiana Circuits have consistently ruled, a trial court judgment that fully disposes of a motion to compel filed by a party against a non-party is final and directly appealable of right because it disposes of all issues as between the party and non-party. See, e.g., Oates v. Cenikor Found., Inc., 2021-0154 (La. App. 1 Cir. 2/12/21), 2021 WL 528514, at \*1 (reversing district court order denying motion for appeal); Amitech, U.S.A., Ltd. v. Nottingham Const. Co., 2005-1981 (La. App. 1 Cir. 2/14/07), 2007 WL 466782, at \*3 n.2; R.J. Gallagher Co. v. Lent, Inc., 361 So. 2d 1231, 1231 (La. App. 1 Cir. 1978); see also McCloskey v. Higman Barge Lines, Inc., 2018-1008 (La. App. 4 Cir. 4/10/19), 269 So. 3d 1173, 1178; S.E. Prop.

Holdings, LLC v. Chunn, 2017-246 (La. App. 3 Cir. 11/8/17), 231 So. 3d 89, 93; Gariepy v. Evans Indus. Inc., 06-106, p. 4 (La. App. 5 Cir. 9/25/07), 968 So. 2d 753, 754–55; Larriviere v. Howard, 2000-186 (La. App. 3 Cir. 10/11/00), 771 So. 2d 747, 750, writ granted in part and remanded, 2000-3087 (La. 1/26/01), 781 So. 2d 567. The February 25, 2021 Judgment is therefore final and directly appealable of right. La. Code Civ. Proc. arts. 1841, 1911, 2083.

3.

Buck Global desires to appeal the February 25, 2021 Judgment to the Court of Appeal, Louisiana First Circuit.

4.

Buck Global has not applied for a new trial or judgment notwithstanding the verdict and this Motion for Appeal is being brought within sixty (60) days of the expiration of the delay for applying for a new trial or judgment notwithstanding the verdict. This motion is therefore timely. See La. Code Civ. Proc. art. 2087(A)(1).

WHEREFORE, Buck Global, LLC respectfully prays that this Court enter the Order presented herewith granting it a devolutive appeal from the Judgment rendered herein on February 25, 2021, returnable to the Court of Appeal, First Circuit, State of Louisiana, thirty (30) days from the date the estimated costs of the appeal are paid, as provided in La. Code of Civ. P. Art. 2125.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ James A. Brown
James A. Brown, T.A. (La. Bar #14101)
Sheri L. Corales (La. Bar #37643)
LISKOW & LEWIS
701 Poydras Street, Suite 5000
New Orleans, Louisiana 70139-5099
Telephone: (504) 581-7979
Facsimile: (504) 556-4108
jabrown@liskow.com

David R. Godofsky, *pro hac vice* (D.C. Bar # 469602)

**ALSTON & BIRD LLP** 

scorales@liskow.com

950 F Street NW Washington, DC 20004 Telephone: (202) 239-3392 Facsimile: (202) 654-4922

David.Godofsky@alston.com

# Attorneys for Buck Global, LLC

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a copy of the above and foregoing has been served upon all counsel of record by e-mail and upon counsel for LDI and Lewis & Ellis, John Ashley Moore, by e-mail this 8th day of March, 2021.

/s/ James A. Brown

# 19TH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT FOR THE PARISH OF EAST BATON ROUGE

#### STATE OF LOUISIANA

NO.: 651,069

**SECTION 22** 

JAMES J. DONELON, COMMISSIONER OF INSURANCE FOR THE STATE OF LOUISIANA, IN HIS CAPACITY AS REHABILITATOR OF LOUISIANA HEALTH COOPERATIVE, INC.

#### **VERSUS**

TERRY S. SHILLING, GEORGE G. CROMER, WARNER L. THOMAS, IV, WILLIAM A. OLIVER, CHARLES D. CALVI, PATRICK C. POWERS, CGI TECHNOLOGIES AND SOLUTIONS, INC., GROUP RESOURCES INCORPORATED, BEAM PARTNERS, LLC, MILLIMAN, INC., BUCK CONSULTANTS, LLC, AND TRAVELERS CASUALTY AND SURETY COMPANY OF AMERICA

FILED:		
FILED.		

#### **ORDER**

Considering the Motion for Devolutive Appeal filed by Buck Global, LLC f/k/a Buck Consultants, LLC ("Buck Global"),

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Buck Global be and is hereby granted a devolutive appeal from the Judgment signed herein on February 25, 2021, denying its Motions to Compel filed against non-parties Louisiana Department of Insurance and Lewis & Ellis, Inc., returnable to the Court of Appeal, First Circuit thirty (30) days from the date the estimated costs of the appeal are paid, as provided in La. Code of Civ. Proc. Art. 2125.

Baton Rouge, Louisiana, this \_\_\_\_\_ Marcharle, 202.1

Honorable Timothy Kelley

District Judge, 19th Judicial District Court

Parish of East Baton Rouge

# 19<sup>TH</sup> JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT STATE OF LOUISIANA

## PARISH OF EAST BATON ROUGE

JAMES J. DONELON, COMMISSIONER OF INSURANCE FOR THE STATE OF LOUISIANA, IN HIS CAPACITY AS REHABILITATOR OF LOUISIANA HEALTH COOPERATIVE, INC.,

NUMBER: 651,069

SECTION: "22"

Plaintiff,

**Defendants** 

**VERSUS** 

TERRY S. SHILLING, GEORGE G.
CROMER, WARNER L. THOMAS, IV,
WILLIAM A. OLIVER, CHARLES D.
CALVI, PATRICK C. POWERS, CGI
TECHNOLOGIES AND SOLUTIONS,
INC., GROUP RESOURCES
INCORPORATED, BEAM PARTNERS,
LLC, MILLIMAN, INC., BUCK
CONSULTANTS, LLC AND
TRAVELERS CASUALTY AND SURETY
COMPANY OF AMERICA,

#### **ORDER**

A hearing, conducted by Zoom, at 9:30 a.m. on February 12, 2021, was held to consider (1) a motion to compel production of documents by the Louisiana Department of Insurance ("LDI") pursuant to subpoena duces tecum requested by Defendant, Buck Global, LLC, f/k/a Buck Consultants, LLC ("Buck Global"), (2) a motion to compel production of documents by Lewis & Ellis, Inc. ("L&E") pursuant to subpoena duces tecum requested by Defendant, Buck Global, and (3) a motion to compel production of documents by LDI pursuant to subpoena duces tecum requested by Defendant, Milliman, Inc. ("Milliman"). Participating in this Zoom hearing were:

John Ashley Moore, for LDI and L&E;

J. Cullens, for Plaintiff, the Receiver of Louisiana Health Cooperative, Inc. ("LAHC" or "Plaintiff" or the "Receiver");

James A. Brown, Sheri Corales, and David Godofsky for Defendant, Buck Global;
Harry Rosenberg, Justin Kattan, and Justine Margolis, for Defendant, Milliman;

W. Brett Mason for Defendant, Group Resources, Inc.;

Considering the briefs filed by the parties, all exhibits attached to the memoranda filed by the parties and filed into the record, applicable law, and the arguments of counsel:

IT IS ORDERED that Defendant Buck Global's motion to compel the Louisiana Department of Insurance is **DENIED**, specifically for the reasons stated at the conclusion of the Zoom hearing;

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Buck Global's motion to compel Lewis & Ellis, Inc. is **DENIED**, specifically for the reasons stated at the conclusion of the Zoom hearing;

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Milliman's motion to compel the Louisiana

Department of Insurance is DENIED, specifically for the reasons stated at the conclusion of the

Zoom hearing;

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, Buck Global and Milliman, shall bear the cost associated with these discovery motions heard by Zoom hearing on February 12, 2021.

SO ORDERED, this	February, 22021
	70.

Honorable Timothy E. Kelley Judge, 19th Judicial District Court

Respectfully submitted,

TAYDOR, PORTER, BROOKS & PHILLIPS L.L.P.

John Askley Moore, LBRN 09635 450 Laurel Street, 8<sup>th</sup> floor (78001)

O. Box 2471

Eaton Rouge, LA 70821 Telephone: (225) 381-0218 Facsimile: (225) 346-8049

Facsimile: (225) 346-8049
Email: ashley.moore@taylorporter.com

Attorneys for Louisiana Department of Insurance and Lewis & Ellis, Inc.

I HEREBY CERTIFY THAT ON THIS DAY A COPY OF THE WRITTEN REASONS FOR JUDGMENT / JUDGMENT / ORDER / COMMISSIONER'S RECOMMENDATION WAS MAILED BY ME WITH SUFFICIENT POSTAGE AFFIXED. SEE ATTACHED LETTER FOR LIST OF RECIPIENTS.

DONE AND MAILED ON March 01, 2021

DEPUTY CLERK OF COURT

## **RULE 9.5 CERTIFICATE**

Undersigned counsel certifies that this proposed ORDER has been circulated to counsel for Defendant, Buck Global, LLC, f/k/a Buck Consultants, LLC ("Buck Global"), Defendant, Milliman, Inc. ("Milliman"), and all parties by electronic mail on February 17, 2021, and that counsel for Buck Global and Milliman agreed to the form of this proposed ORDER, prior to filing.

Baton Rouge, Louisiana, this 23 day of February, 2021.

# CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing ORDER has been sent via electronic mail

to all counsel of record as follows:

W. Brett Mason Michael W. McKay

Stone Pigman Walther Wittmann One American Place, Suite 1150

301 Main Street

Baton Rouge, LA 70825 Telephone: (225) 490-5800 Facsimile: (225) 490-5860

Email: <a href="mailto:bmason@stonepigman.com">bmason@stonepigman.com</a>
Email: <a href="mailto:mmckay@stonepigman.com">mmckay@stonepigman.com</a>

James A. Brown Sheri L. Corales Liskow & Lewis

701 Poydras Street, Suite 5000 New Orleans, LA 70139-5099 Telephone: (504) 581-7979 Facsimile: (504) 556-4108 Email: jabrown@liskow.com Email: scorales@liskow.com

David R. Godofsky Alston & Bird The Atlantic Building 950 F Street, NW

Washington, D.C. 20004-1404 Telephone: (202) 239-3392 Facsimile: (202) 654-4922

Email: david.godofsky@alston.com

Seth A. Schmeekle

Lugenbuhl, Wheaton, Peck, Ranking & Hubbard

601 Poydras Street, Suite 2775 New Orleans, LA 70130 Telephone: 504-568-1990 Facsimile: 504-310-9195

Email: sschmeeckle@lawla.com

George D. Fagan Leake & Andersson

1100 Poydras Street, Suite 1700 New Orleans, LA 70163 Telephone: (504) 585-7612 Facsimile: (504) 585-7775

Email: gfagan@leakeandersson.com

Thomas McEachin

Schonekas, Evans, McGoey & McEachin, LLC

909 Poydras Street, Suite 1600 Telephone: (504) 680-6055 Facsimile: (504) 680-6051 Email: <a href="mailto:thomas@semmlaw.com">thomas@semmlaw.com</a> Harry Rosenberg Phelps Dunbar LLP

365 Canal Street, Suite 2000 New Orleans, LA 70130-6534 Telephone: (504) 566-1311 Facsimile: (504) 568-9130

Email: harry.rosenberg@phelps.com

H. Alston Johnson Phelps Dunbar LLP

400 Convention Street, Suite 1100

Baton Rouge, LA 70802 Telephone: (225) 346-0285 Facsimile: (225) 381-997 Email: johnsona@phelps.com

Reid L. Ashinoff
Justin N. Kattan
Justine N. Margolis
Catharine Luo
Dentons US LLP

1221 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10020 Telephone: (212) 768-6700 Facsimile: (212) 768-6800

Email: reid.ashinoff@dentons.com
Email: Justin.kattan@dentons.com
Email: justine.margalis@dentons.com
Email: Catharine.luo@dentons.com

Michael A. Balascio
Barrasso Usdin Kupperman
909 Poydras Street, 24<sup>th</sup> Floor
New Orleans, LA 70112
Telephone: (504) 589-9773
Facsimile: (504) 589-9701

Email: mbalascio@barrassousdin.com

Karl H. Schmid

Degan, Blanchard & Nash 400 Poydras Street, Suite 2600 New Orleans, LA 70130 Telephone: (504) 529-3333 Facsimile: (504) 529-3337 Email: kschmid@degan.com

John W. Hite, III

Salley, Hite, Mercer & Resso, LLC 365 Canal Street, Suite 1710 New Orleans, LA 70130 Telephone: (504) 566-8802 Email: jhite@shmrlaw.com

4

J. E. Cullens Jr.
Andree M. Cullens
Walters, Papillion, Thomas, Cullens, LLC
12345 Perkins Rd

Baton Rouge, LA 70810 Telephone: (225) 236-3636 Facsimile: (225) 236-3650 Email: <u>cullens@lawbr.net</u>

Email: <u>acullens@lawbr.net</u>
Email: <u>acullens@lawbr.net</u>

Robert B. Bieck, Jr.
Jones Walker, LLP
201 St. Charles Ave., 49<sup>th</sup> Floor
New Orleans, LA 70170
Telephone: (504) 582-8202
Facsimile: (504) 589-8202
Email: rbieck@joneswalker.com

Moore

Baton Rouge, Louisiana this 23rd day of February, 202